Morgan Stanley

Update on algorithmic trading in bond markets

Andrew Millward

Head of EMEA Macro Trading

Prepared for the ECB BMCG Meeting 20 November 2019

THIS IS SALES AND TRADING COMMENTARY PREPARED FOR INSTITUTIONAL INVESTORS; it is NOT a research report; tax, legal, financial, or accounting advice; or an official confirm. The views of the author may differ from others at MS (including MS Research). MS may engage in conflicting activities -- including principal trading before or after sending these views -- market making, lending, and the provision of investment banking or other services related to instruments/issuers mentioned. No investment decision should be made in reliance on this material, which is condensed and incomplete; does not include all risk factors or other matters that may be material; does not take into account your investment objectives, financial conditions, or needs; and IS NOT A PERSONAL RECOMMENDATION OR INVESTMENT ADVICE or a basis to consider MS to be a fiduciary or municipal or other type of advisor. It constitutes an invitation to consider entering into derivatives transactions under CFTC Rules 1.71 and 23.605 (where applicable) but is not a binding offer to buy or sell any financial instrument or enter into any transaction. It is based upon sources believed to be reliable (but no representation of accuracy or completeness is made) and is likely to change without notice. Any price levels are indicative only and not intended for use by third parties. Subject to additional terms at http://www.morganstanley.com/disclosures.

For Eligible Counterparties and Professional Clients Only.
Please see additional important information and qualifications at the end of this material.

Morgan Stanley

1.

How bond market algorithms differ from those developed for other markets

Andrew Millward, Morgan Stanley

How bond market algorithms differ from those developed for other markets

The design of market-making algorithms is dictated by the particular market structure of each asset class.

PRICE FORMATION

1 *Defining fair value*

FX	Data driven	• Aggregation of market data feeds across regions and venues • Where is the latest and most relevant information? • How fast can you ingest, digest and react to market changes?
EGBs	Model driven	• Utilize futures price and reference price (ie, TW composite) • How do you define relationships between correlated instruments?

2 *Building a price around the fair value mid*

FX	Low information environment	• Often trade on stream with limited pre-trade information • Send best possible price
EGBs	Complex information set	• Win the inquiry; then win the trade • Ability to build a price using historical data and RFQ-specific information

INVENTORY AND RISK MANAGEMENT

3 *Hedging instruments & hold times*

FX	Same-security hedging	• Hedge with the same instrument • Close position at will in the market • Short hold times
EGBs	More instrument fungibility	• Most risk is lower-order; hedge duration but left with spread, curve or basis risk • Holding periods are longer • No guarantee of finding a price in the same security

For Eligible Counterparties and Professional Clients Only.
Please see additional important information and qualifications at the end of this material.

Morgan Stanley

2.

How algorithms can affect the market functioning and what could be done to mitigate those risks

Andrew Millward, Morgan Stanley

Impacts of algorithmic pricing on trading and execution behavior

Algorithmic pricing has many beneficial consequences for the liquidity landscape and buy-side execution, including benefits for voice trading

1. Market making desks are able to disseminate prices to a wide audience quickly and efficiently

2. Algorithmic execution incentivizes clients to break down trades into smaller clips, allowing for automated execution, limiting market impact and minimizing information leakage

3. More data available to both buy and sell side, enabling data-driven counterparty selection, pre and post-trade analysis

4. Algorithmic pricing and automated responses gives voice traders more capacity to allow for focus on complex situations or large risk transfer

5. Market makers are able to provide faster and more consistent responses to inquiries

Challenges introduced by increased algorithmic pricing

The impacts of a market structure evolution depend on the ways in which clients and market makers adapt to the changes

Challenges for market makers in an increasingly automated market making environment:

- Increasing reliance on technology and stability of ECNs/exchanges/venues
  - For connectivity to hedging sources
  - To perform real-time reconciliation of trades
  - Introduces need to monitor outages, connectivity, latency, limits
- A shift in execution methods will impact the type of pre-trade information exchanged
  - There is different information value in large block trades vs. smaller electronic clips
  - There is different information value for in-comp RFQs vs. trades on bilateral streams
  - The counterparties in a bilateral out-of-comp trade both benefit, with limited information leakage / market impact
- Necessitates a cultural shift on the trading floor
  - Different skill sets become very valuable
  - Flow sales must adapt to a changing method of execution and dealer measurement from their clients
- Client expectations for fast and consistent responses can be difficult to fulfill in volatile market conditions
  - In an increasingly electronic environment, the absence of automated pricing or electronic liquidity during periods of high volatility can be disruptive to a client's regular workflow

Steps for risk mitigation

Algorithmic trading requires a focus on operational resiliency of the plant and strict controls

1	**Plant capacity**	Ensuring sufficient capacity for a material increase in volume, volatility or market failure
2	**Outage management**	Minimize risks that system failures prevent access to the markets; minimize duration of any incidents
3	**E-Trading governance**	Sufficient oversight and management to minimize operational risks, oversee client enablement processes, technology incident reviews, etc
4	**Algo governance**	Strategic governance framework to review new models or material changes to existing algorithms
5	**Risk controls**	Multi-layered overlapping controls designed to manage market impact, counterparty risk, market risk, low latency controls / kill switches

Algorithmic market makers must strike a balance between protecting the book from risk events while also consistently providing prices to clients

Possible impact on bond market functioning

- **"Flash crashes" have historically occurred in substantially electronic markets where there is a temporary supply/demand imbalance in thin liquidity conditions, and mechanical rules-based strategies are triggered**
- **In the European bond markets, a significant move in Futures prices would be a catalyst for algorithmic pricing to be temporarily turned off or widened**
  - Market makers would have difficulty hedging if there is volatility or lack of liquidity in the futures market
  - However, liquidity would still be available to clients, albeit with more conservative and likely manual pricing

While turning off algorithmic pricing in periods of market stress could temporarily disrupt the EGB market, the biggest impact is to the client experience.

The information in this material was prepared by sales, trading, or other non-research personnel of Morgan Stanley for institutional investors. This is not a research report, and unless otherwise indicated, the views herein (if any) are the author's and may differ from those of our Research Department or others in the Firm. This material is not impartial and is not independent of the interests of our trading and other activities, which may conflict with your interests. We may deal in any of the markets, issuers, or instruments mentioned herein before or after providing this information, as principal, market maker, or liquidity provider and may also seek to advise issuers or other market participants. Where you provide us with information relating to an order, inquiry, or potential transaction, we may use that information to facilitate execution and in managing our market making and hedging activities. This material does not provide (and should not be construed to be) investment advice (including, without limitation, as defined under the Employee Benefit Income Security Act of 1974, as amended or similar concepts under applicable law) or offer tax, regulatory, accounting, or legal advice. By submitting this document to you, Morgan Stanley is not your fiduciary, municipal, or any other type of advisor. This material is general in nature and not based on a consideration of any individual client circumstances and thus should not be considered a recommendation to any recipient or group of recipients. This material is an invitation to consider entering into derivatives transactions under CFTC Rules 1.71 and 23.605 (where applicable) but is not a binding offer to buy or sell any instrument or enter into any transaction. To receive further information in relation to the past performance of the financial instrument and or underlying (as applicable) and/or the functioning of the financial instrument in different market conditions referred to in any communications produced by Employees of any Morgan Stanley entity based in EMEA, please contact your EMEA Morgan Stanley Sales representative. Unless otherwise specifically indicated, all information in these materials with respect to any third party entity not affiliated with Morgan Stanley has been provided by, and is the sole responsibility of, such third party and has not been independently verified by Morgan Stanley, our affiliates or any other independent third party. We make no express or implied representation or warranty with respect to the accuracy or completeness of this material, nor will we undertake to provide updated information or notify recipients when information contained herein becomes stale. Any prices contained herein are indicative only and should not be relied upon for valuation or for any use with third parties. All financial information is taken from company disclosures and presentations (including 10Q, 10K and 8K filings and other public announcements), unless otherwise noted. Any securities referred to in this material may not have been registered under the U.S. Securities Act of 1933, as amended and, if not, may not be offered or sold absent an exemption therefrom. In relation to any member state of the European Economic Area, a prospectus may not have been published pursuant to measures implementing the Prospectus Directive (2003/71/EC) and any securities referred to herein may not be offered in circumstances that would require such publication. Recipients are required to comply with any legal or contractual restrictions on their purchase, holding, sale, exercise of rights, or performance of obligations under any instrument or otherwise applicable to any transaction. In addition, a secondary market may not exist for certain of the instruments referenced herein. The value of and income from investments may vary because of, among other things, changes in interest rates, foreign exchange rates, default rates, prepayment rates, securities, prices of instruments or securities, market indexes, operational, or financial conditions of companies or other factors. There may be time limitations on the exercise of options or other rights in instruments (or related derivatives) transactions. Past performance is not necessarily a guide to future performance. Estimates of future performance are based on assumptions that may not be realized. Actual events may differ from those assumed, and changes to any assumptions may have a material impact on any projections or estimates. Other events not taken into account may occur and may significantly affect any projections or estimates. Certain assumptions may have been made for modelling purposes only to simplify the presentation or calculation of any projections or estimates, and Morgan Stanley does not represent that any such assumptions will reflect actual future events or that all assumptions have been considered or stated. Accordingly, there can be no assurance that any hypothetical estimated returns or projections will be realized or that actual returns or performance results will not materially differ. Some of the information contained in this document may be aggregated data of transactions executed by Morgan Stanley that has been compiled so as not to identify the underlying transactions of any particular customer. This information is not intended to be provided to and may not be used by any person or entity in any jurisdiction where the provision or use thereof would be contrary to applicable laws, rules, or regulations. This communication is directed to and meant for sophisticated investors, including specifically, institutional investors in the U.S and/or those persons who are eligible counterparties or professional clients in the European Economic Area. It must not be re-distributed to or relied upon by retail clients. This information is being disseminated in Hong Kong by Morgan Stanley Asia Limited and is intended for professional investors (as defined in the Securities and Futures Ordinance) and is not directed at the public of Hong Kong. This information is being disseminated in Singapore by Morgan Stanley Asia (Singapore) Pte. (the “SG Regulated Entity”) and/or on behalf of certain of its affiliates pursuant to certain arrangements with the SG Regulated Entity This information has not been registered as a prospectus with the Monetary Authority of Singapore (“MAS”). Accordingly, this information and any other document or material in connection with the offer or sale, or invitation for subscription or purchase, of this capital markets product may not be circulated or distributed, nor may this capital markets product be offered or sold, or be made the subject of an invitation for subscription or purchase, whether directly or indirectly, to persons in Singapore other than (i) to an institutional investor (as defined in Section 4A of the Securities and Futures Act, Chapter 289 of Singapore (the “SFA”)) under Section 274 of the SFA or, as the case may be, Section 276(2); (ii) to an accredited investor (as defined in Section 4A of the SFA) in accordance with the conditions specified in Section 275 of the SFA or, as the case may be, Section 276(2); (iii) to a relevant person pursuant to Section 275(1), or any person pursuant to Section 275(1A), or, as the case may be, Section 276(2) and in accordance with the conditions specified in Section 275, of the SFA, where each such person is (1) an expert investor (as defined in Section 4A of the SFA) or (2) not an individual. Any offering of this capital markets product in Singapore would be through the SG Regulated Entity who is an entity regulated by the MAS. This information is being disseminated in Japan by Morgan Stanley MUFG Securities Co., Ltd. (For guidance purposes only, Morgan Stanley MUFG Securities Co., Ltd is a joint venture in Japan between Morgan Stanley and Mitsubishi UFJ Financial Group. Morgan Stanley and Mitsubishi UFJ Financial Group have formed another joint venture in Japan called Mitsubishi UFJ Morgan Stanley Securities Co., Ltd). Any securities referred to herein may not have been and/or will not be registered under the Financial Instruments Exchange Law of Japan (Law No. 25 of 1948, as amended, hereinafter referred to as the “Financial Instruments Exchange Law of Japan”). Such securities may not be offered, sold, or transferred, directly or indirectly, to or for the benefit of any resident of Japan unless pursuant to an exemption from the registration requirements of and otherwise in compliance with the Financial Instruments Exchange Law and other relevant laws and regulations of Japan. As used in this paragraph, “resident of Japan” means any person resident in Japan, including any corporation or other entity organized or engaged in business under the laws of Japan. If you reside in Japan, please contact Morgan Stanley MUFG Securities for further details at +813-6836-5000.This information is distributed in Australia by Morgan Stanley Australia Limited A.B.N. 67 003 734 576, holder of Australian financial services license No. 233742, which accepts responsibility for its contents, and arranges for it to be provided to potential clients. In Australia, this report, and any access to it, is intended only for "wholesale clients" within the meaning of the Australian Corporations Act. For additional information and important disclosures see http://www.morganstanley.com/disclosures. The trademarks and service marks contained herein are the property of their respective owners. Third-party data providers make no warranties or representations of any kind relating to the accuracy, completeness, or timeliness of the data they provide and shall not have liability for any damages of any kind relating to such data. This material may not be redistributed without the prior written consent of Morgan Stanley. © 2019 Morgan Stanley